GOVERNMENT OF THE PEOPLE: A CONUNDRUM IN A CHEF D'OEUVRE

R. Ilson

University College London, London, United Kingdom, robert.ilson@outlook.com

Abstract: In this article I attempt to shed new light on one of the most famous passages in American literature: Abraham Lincoln's "government of the people, by the people, for the people".

Key words: literature; ambiguity; interpretation

For citation: Ilson R. (2022) Government of the People: a Conundrum in a Chef d'oeuvre. Moscow State University Bulletin. Series 19. Linguistics and Intercultural Communication, no. 1, pp. 35–36. (In Russ.)

«НАРОДНОЕ ПРАВИТЕЛЬСТВО»: ЗАГАДКА ШЕДЕВРА

Р. Илсон

Университетский Колледж Лондона, Лондон, Великобритания, robert.ilson@outlook.com

Аннотация. В статье уделяется внимание интерпретации одной из известных в американской литературе цитат из высказываний Авраама Линкольна – «правительство народа, избранное народом и для народа».

Ключевые слова: литература; двойственность; интерпретация

Для цитирования: Илсон Р. «Народное правительство»: загадка шедевра // Вестн. Моск. ун-та. Сер. 19. Лингвистика и межкультурная коммуникация. 2022. № 1. С. 35–36.

In the climax of his masterpiece, the Gettysburg Address, Abraham Lincoln called upon his hearers to defend "government of the people, by the people, for the people". The parallelism of these three marching phrases suggests a parallelism of their meanings. And indeed two of those meanings seem clear enough. "Government for the people" means government in the people's interest: government in the interest of the people". "Government by the people" means 'government by means of the people themselves': self-government either directly (direct democracy) or through representatives (republican democracy).

But what about "government of the people"? That phrase is ambiguous. It could mean 'government consisting of the people': in which case it would be almost synonymous with government by the people. But it could also mean 'governing [of] the people'. In that case it would be superordinate to both government by the people and government for the people. President Lincoln's memorable words would then be glossed as 'governing the people by means of the people themselves and in the interest of the people'.

The ambiguity of the phrase "government of the people" is reminiscent of the ambiguity of the famous example "the love of God", which can mean both 'God's love of us' and 'our love of God'. Analogously, "government of the people" can mean both 'the people's government of the State' and 'the State's government of the people'.

Have we any way of deciding between those two interpretations of "government of the people"? Probably not with any certainty. But there is at least one clue of some weight. According to Wikipedia, William Herndon, Lincoln's law partner, had shown Lincoln a sermon by "the abolitionist minister Theodore Parker" that includes the formula "Democracy is direct self-government, over all the people, for all the people, by all the people"; where "self-government, over all the people" seems equivalent to "governing all the people (by the people)". That's the solution I favour, and it fits well into an imaginary conversation such as the following:

"How should the people be governed?" "By the people themselves and in their interest".

Or to put it into the text of the Gettysburg Address:

"we here highly resolve ... that government of the people, which should be by the people and for the people, shall not perish from the earth".

Another phrase that comes to mind in connexion with "government of the people" above is "government on behalf of the people". But that phrase seems to be unambiguously synonymous with "government for the people".

Статья поступила в редакцию 10.08.2021; одобрена после рецензирования 10.09.2021; принята к публикации 27.09.2021

The article was submitted 10.08.2021; approved after reviewing 10.09.2021; accepted for publication 27.09.2021

About the author

Robert Ilson – Honorary Researcher Fellow of University College London, UK, Honorary Member of the European Association for Lexicography, robert.ilson@ outlook.com

Сведения об авторе

Роберт Илсон – профессор, почетный научный сотрудник Университетского колледжа Лондона, Лондон, Великобритания, почетный член Европейской ассоциации лексикографии, robert.ilson@outlook.com